Occasionally missing bits of widgets in the top-right GNOME Shell tray on Jessie

11/18/2015 01:39 AM - intrigeri

Status: Confirmed
Priority: Elevated
Assignee:
Category:
Target version:
Feature Branch:
Type of work: Research
Blueprint:

% Done: 10%
Estimated time: 0.00 hour
Spent time: 0.00 hour

Description
Sometimes, I don't see the date/time nor the ibus menu icon. It seems random and exact symptoms vary. I think that sajolida has seen it too.

In my case (Spice/QXL/QEMU VM), where I can dynamically change the display size & resolution, making the display way bigger fixes the bug, and reverting to the initial display size reverts back to the problematic initial state.

Related issues:
Related to Tails - Bug #10807: Vidalia icon is sometimes not visible or hidde... Resolved 12/31/2015
Related to Tails - Bug #8309: Remove the toplicons GNOME Shell extension Confirmed 11/20/2014
Related to Tails - Bug #11045: Opening Florence from the Applications menu cr... Resolved 02/02/2016
Duplicated by Tails - Bug #10963: New icons 'push' the others to the right on... Duplicate 01/17/2016

Associated revisions
Revision 6a712dca - 01/10/2016 08:54 PM - intrigeri
Add known issues.
refs: #10576, #10807, #9012

Revision 30431d85 - 03/08/2016 01:38 PM - intrigeri
Re-add lost known issues.
refs: #10576, #10807, #9012
Commit 6a712dca8fd8fcfd113034504a7a31f6707e106e was lost somehow, probably in a buggy merge resolution.

Revision 51c633e7 - 07/30/2016 03:40 PM - intrigeri
Replace TopIcons with gnome-shell-extension-top-icons-plus.
The former causes plenty of trouble and is apparently abandoned upstream. The latter is actively maintained upstream, and packaged in Debian.
refs: #10576
I'll do some research before I evaluate if it's a blocker for 2.0.

To clarify, there are at least two different bugs that we should not mix up:

1. The one I've reported here, where widgets in the tray are somewhat narrowed (to their arrow, with a dot instead of the expected text);
2. One I see on a ThinkPad X61, where (as soon as the "Synchronizing the system's clock" notification appears) some widgets in the tray (main top-right menu, accessibility, arrow icon of the keyboard layout switcher) become invisible unless clicked, but retain their original full width. Let's please not discuss this one here, and instead file a dedicated ticket if, and only if, we can reproduce it on hardware that satisfies our documented requirements.

In the last set of logs + screenshot sajolida sent me, I see exactly the same symptom, and this line is in his logs too. It’s also in his logs from another session that exposed a similar bug.

I'm not sure where this leads me, but at least I feel I can now possibly work on it. Maybe.

In the first set of logs + screenshot sajolida sent me, I see topicons-related error that are similar to those on #10807#note-3, but not exactly the same:

```javascript
Jan 06 11:08:33 amnesia gnome-session[30034]: (gnome-shell:30263): Gjs-WARNING **: JS ERROR: TypeError: parent is null
Jan 06 11:08:33 amnesia gnome-session[30034]: moveToTop@/usr/share/gnome-shell/extensions/topIcons@adel.gadlla
h@gmail.com/extension.js:135
```
I don't seem to be able to reproduce this bug with an ISO that has the topIcons extension disabled:

```diff
--- a/config/chroot_local-includes/etc/dconf/db/local.d/00_Tails_defaults
+++ b/config/chroot_local-includes/etc/dconf/db/local.d/00_Tails_defaults
@@ -85,5 +85,5 @@
   antialiasing = 'rgba'
   hinting = 'slight'

 [org/gnome/shell]
-enabled-extensions = ['apps-menu@gnome-shell-extensions.gcampax.github.com', 'window-list@gnome-shell-extensi
ons.gcampax.github.com', 'topicons@adel.gadillah@gmail.com', 'shutdown-helper@tails.boum.org']
+enabled-extensions = ['apps-menu@gnome-shell-extensions.gcampax.github.com', 'window-list@gnome-shell-extensi
ons.gcampax.github.com', 'shutdown-helper@tails.boum.org']
 favorite-apps=['tor-browser.desktop', 'icedove.desktop', 'pidgin.desktop', 'keepassx.desktop', 'gnome-termina
l.desktop']
```

I don't know if the topIcons extension is buggy, or merely triggering a bug in GNOME Shell. In the source code of topIcons, in function onTrayIconAdded, I see something that looks like a crude hack, that waits 500ms twice and then gives up. I would not be surprised if this was not very reliable under heavy load. Perhaps #8309 is more urgent that we thought?

---

#10 - 01/09/2016 11:48 PM - intrigeri
- Related to Bug #8309: Remove the topicons GNOME Shell extension added

#11 - 01/10/2016 10:00 PM - intrigeri
- Status changed from Confirmed to In Progress
- % Done changed from 0 to 10

Documented as a known issue on the devel branch. I'll call for help to debug the topIcons thing and/or to work on the blockers of #8309, whichever is easier to find motivated people for. I doubt this is fixed in 2.0 final, so I'm counting on #8309 a bit more, but there's still hope!

#12 - 01/10/2016 10:16 PM - intrigeri
Called for help, and summed up the three options I see: https://mailman.boum.org/pipermail/tails-dev/2016-January/010060.html

#13 - 01/10/2016 10:20 PM - intrigeri
- Priority changed from Normal to Elevated

#14 - 01/13/2016 11:08 AM - sajolida
- File clickable area.png added
Another quite annoying symptom of this issue (still present in rc1) is that clickable areas of widgets and their icons are not at the same place. For example, nothing happens when I click on the Florence icon but Florence appears when I click elsewhere (on the left of the OpenPGP Applet). See screenshot.

#15 - 01/17/2016 09:09 PM - intrigeri
- Related to Bug #10963: New icons 'push' the others to the right on right-top bar. added

#16 - 01/19/2016 03:24 PM - intrigeri
sajolida wrote:

Another quite annoying symptom of this issue (still present in rc1) is that clickable areas of widgets and their icons are not at the same place. For example, nothing happens when I click on the Florence icon but Florence appears when I click elsewhere (on the left of the OpenPGP Applet). See screenshot.

I see that there's a hack in the code to handle clickProxy.set_position. I suspect it's not done at the right time, or should be done once more, or something.

#17 - 01/19/2016 07:00 PM - intrigeri
Similar issues reported elsewhere:

- on https://extensions.gnome.org/extension/495/topicons/ quite a few similar problems are described
- https://www.reddit.com/r/archlinux/comments/2q0617/icons_disappearing_from_notification_tray_using/
- https://bugzilla.redhat.com/show_bug.cgi?id=1269181

Potential alternative to topIcons:

- the https://github.com/wincinderith/topicons fork has changes in areas that might be relevant to the problems we see
- https://extensions.gnome.org/extension/192/status-icon-fixer/

#18 - 01/19/2016 07:23 PM - intrigeri
- File new-session.png added

#19 - 01/19/2016 07:53 PM - intrigeri
Reported upstream via https://extensions.gnome.org/extension/495/topicons/ and over direct email (topicons@adel.gadallah@gmail.com). Asked for help to a few GNOME people (tails-dev@ Cc'ed).

#20 - 01/19/2016 08:00 PM - intrigeri
Tweeted the call for help (this is what I'm doing in 2016, really? :) https://twitter.com/Tails_live/status/689537619928178690

#21 - 01/26/2016 12:09 PM - intrigeri
Forwarded the call for help to the GNOME Shell mailing-list yesterday.

#22 - 02/02/2016 05:38 PM - sajolida
- Related to Bug #11045: Opening Florence from the Applications menu creates a duplicate widget in the top icons added

#23 - 02/10/2016 12:07 PM - intrigeri
I got some more info, screenshots and logs. Perhaps we could document "disable topicons, restart GNOME Shell, enable topicons" as a workaround.

#24 - 02/13/2016 04:19 AM - intrigeri
Just seen it in the automated test suite! FWIW, everything looks fine until the Vidalia icon appears.

#25 - 02/27/2016 10:12 AM - intrigeri
- Assignee changed from intrigeri to emmapeel
- Target version changed from Tails_2.2 to Tails_2.3
- QA Check set to Info Needed

emmapeel, sajolida: is this fixed (thanks to #6841) for you in 2.2-rc1, or 2.2 final?

If not, it would be great to retry without adding any non-default icon to the area managed by topicons (IIRC you folks both use additional software that adds stuff in there).

Thanks!

#26 - 02/29/2016 12:40 PM - intrigeri
Note to myself: removing Vidalia did not fully fix this: https://jenkins.tails.boum.org/job/manual_test_Tails_ISO_experimental/50/

#27 - 03/03/2016 11:27 PM - intrigeri
- Assignee changed from emmapeel to intrigeri
- QA Check deleted (Info Needed)

Still happens on 2.2-rc1.

#28 - 03/07/2016 11:36 AM - sajolida
In the coming days I'll try to experiment with removing one by one the widgets we have in TopIcons. Maybe it was not Vidalia but another one that was generating the bug.

#29 - 03/07/2016 05:53 PM - emmapeel
After many days of not opening it, and not seeing the bug, today I had this problem again after opening KeepassX (Qt based like Vidalia)

#30 - 03/08/2016 10:55 AM - intrigeri
- Related to deleted (Bug #10963: New icons 'push' the others to the right on right-top bar.)

#31 - 03/08/2016 10:56 AM - intrigeri
- Duplicated by Bug #10963: New icons 'push' the others to the right on right-top bar. added

#32 - 03/15/2016 05:14 PM - sajolida
I reproduced this today with Florence disabled and KeePassX not in the tray icons either. I had OpenPGP Applet, Pidgin, and Clementine (custom).

#33 - 03/16/2016 11:37 AM - sajolida
I reproduced this again today with only Florence and Clementine (no Pidgin, no KeePassX, no OpenPGP Applet).
So it seems like this bug cannot be attributed to an icon in particular but more generally to the TopIcon extension, GNOME Classic, GNOME Shell, or whatever GNOME plumbing is behind that.

I would be interested in testing with the default GNOME Shell + Applications menu + TopIcons + Window list (instead of GNOME Classic) but I'm not sure how to go about that...

#34 - 03/16/2016 02:16 PM - intrigeri
I would be interested in testing with the default GNOME Shell + Applications menu + TopIcons + Window list (instead of GNOME Classic)

My understanding is that GNOME Classic = GNOME Shell + apps menu + window list, so I doubt it'll be any different.

#35 - 03/17/2016 02:48 PM - sajolida
Reproduced today with only Clementine in tray icons.

#36 - 04/14/2016 09:39 PM - intrigeri
- Target version changed from Tails_2.3 to Hole in the Roof

Interestingly, it seems to be that the bug is only triggered when one starts a **Qt4** application (Vidalia, Clementine, KeePassX) that puts an icon in the notification area. Thanks to emmapeel for the idea, and to sajolida for the recent reproducer with Clementine!

Now, I have to admit I won’t manage to fix this any time soon, so this becomes a Hole in the Roof. I think we should get rid of the topicons temporary hack, but quite clearly we’re not there yet :/

#37 - 04/16/2016 05:16 PM - emmapeel
intringer wrote:

Interestingly, it seems to be that the bug is only triggered when one starts a **Qt4** application (Vidalia, Clementine, KeePassX) that puts an icon in the notification area. Thanks to emmapeel for the idea, and to sajolida for the recent reproducer with Clementine!

You can thank me for sharing the idea, but it was actually anonym who realised it was triggered mostly with Qt4 apps...

Let me know if there is some ISO to test...
Today I reproduced this when starting Pidgin (which is Gtk I think). I had started: Florence, OpenPGP Applet, and Pidgin. See screenshots in attachment (as always restart GNOME Shell brings everything back in place).

Thanks, this allows us to dismiss the "Qt applets don't play well with topicons" idea.

So we're back at "topicons + Window list extensions don't play well together". I'm very much tempted to propose we drop the list of windows, as a way to 1. transition further towards a regular GNOME Shell experience; 2. fix this bug.

sajolida, emmapeel: any one of you want to experiment with current Tails and the "Window list" extension disabled, and report back if this bug happens in that context?

So we're back at "topicons + Window list extensions don't play well together".

It's the first time I hear about this hypothesis or at least I don't find any reference to it on this ticket. I'm not against it but for me it was the topicons as such which was problematic:

sajolida, emmapeel: any one of you want to experiment with current Tails and the "Window list" extension disabled, and report back if this bug happens in that context?

I don't mind trying this but I don't manage to disable the window list in Tails. It's marked as "On" in Tweak Tool but it's not disabled when I turned it "Off". The same applies to "Applications menu" but not to other extensions, like "Top icons", so maybe it has something to do with the classical mode...

I also tried to override 'org/gnome/desktop/session' through a dotfile in /etc/dconf/db/local.d/01_Pure_shell with:

```
[org/gnome/desktop/session]
session-name='gnome'
```
But it's not applied and I still get 'gnome-classic' after restarting and executing dconf dump '/org/gnome/desktop/session'.

Any other idea?

---

**#41** - 05/05/2016 08:53 AM - intrigeri

So we're back at "topIcons + Window list extensions don't play well together".

It's the first time I hear about this hypothesis or at least I don't find any reference to it on this ticket. I'm not against it but for me it was the topIcons as such which was problematic.

I was confused, sorry. Forget the "Window list" part.

I don't mind trying this [...]  

Forget that part too. Sorry for the confusion!

---

**#42** - 05/09/2016 02:28 AM - anonym

Possibly related: I just booted a devel-build where I only have the GNOME Applications menu, not Places.

**#43** - 05/09/2016 04:49 PM - sajolida

Interesting... For what it's worth, I'm facing this bug every day and never saw this.

**#44** - 07/18/2016 07:53 AM - intrigeri


---

**#45** - 07/18/2016 12:49 PM - sajolida

Yeap, I'm fine testing this but as you rightly guessed, I'll be more happy with more instructions...

---

**#46** - 07/18/2016 02:48 PM - intrigeri
Yeap, I'm fine testing this but as you rightly guessed, I'll be more happy with more instructions...

Of course :)

---

**#47 - 07/30/2016 06:40 AM - intrigeri**

Sadly, TopIcons Plus is not compatible with Jessie's GNOME Shell, so here are (untested) instructions for Tails/Stretch.

1. Use rootpw= to set a root password (since our Greeter is broken on Stretch), then go through GDM (iirc logging with amnesia/amnesia works).

2. As root run:

   ```
   apt update && apt install gnome-shell-extension-top-icons-plus
   ```

3. As amnesia run:

   ```
   gnome-shell-extension-tool --disable 'topIcons@adel.gadallah@gmail.com' && \
   gnome-shell-extension-tool --enable 'TopIcons@phocean.net'
   ```

4. Then do whatever usually triggers this bug, see what happens, and report back.

---

**#48 - 07/30/2016 10:00 AM - intrigeri**

intrigeri wrote:

Sadly, TopIcons Plus is not compatible with Jessie's GNOME Shell, so here are (untested) instructions for Tails/Stretch.

feature/stretch now installs TopIcons Plus instead of TopIcons. See #11442#note-5 for tips wrt. using an ISO based on Stretch (warning: rough edges).
We see this bug a lot in the test suite on the devel branch since a bunch of my test suite work was merged a week ago. So it might be worth backporting to Tails 2.x the work I'm doing in this area on feature/stretch (see subtasks of #8309), once our test suite shows that it actually helps.

---

I can reproduce quite often when using Gnotime. Less often with Keepassx. Also in Tails 2.6

Could not find more in the logs than the very spammy:

```
Sep 25 08:48:26 amnesia gnome-session[28320]: (gnome-shell:28464): mutter-WARNING **: STACK_OP_RAISE_ABOVE: window 0x5c01400016 not in stack
```

---

Can you still reproduce this on Tails 3.x? If you can, please send me a screenshot + WhisperBack "technical details".

---

I don't remember seeing this in 3.0 → \o/

---

mercedes508 has seen this problem on bare metal on Tails 3.0.

The logs show no error message that rings any bell, except the usual TopIcon-related ones.

---

I wonder if https://bugzilla.gnome.org/show_bug.cgi?id=781760 might be involved ⇒ anyone affected, please let me know if you ever see this problem on a Tails system whose screen has never been locked and where the screensaver has never been activated.

---

I'm using Tails every day and was affected by this a lot in Tails 2.x but I don't remember seeing in months (in Tails 3.x at all?).

I still see GNOME Shell restarting now and then but no missing widgets.

Maybe other daily users can confirm.
I'm using Tails every day and was affected by this a lot in Tails 2.x but I don't remember seeing in months (in Tails 3.x at all?).

This is good to know! Based on this feedback, I was almost going to close this ticket, assuming it was fixed by the upgrade to Stretch, but then I noticed that the problem has been seen once on 3.0, so it's not that simple :/

On #10576 I mentioned a way that helped me reproduce this problem (that's quite clearly a race condition). It would be sweet if someone could try this with current Tails 3.x, and ideally with feature/buster. But no big deal if we don't, because in any case, we have other good reasons than this ticket to do #8309, starting with the GNOME Shell crashes sajolida still experiences (#11188), and once we've done #8309 we can close this very ticket.

Files

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>File Name</th>
<th>Size</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>User</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>journal</td>
<td>524 KB</td>
<td>11/18/2015</td>
<td>intrigeri</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>screenshot.png</td>
<td>3.47 KB</td>
<td>11/18/2015</td>
<td>intrigeri</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>clickable area.png</td>
<td>65.6 KB</td>
<td>01/13/2016</td>
<td>sajolida</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>new-session.png</td>
<td>7.82 KB</td>
<td>01/19/2016</td>
<td>intrigeri</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>broken-without-qt.png</td>
<td>6 KB</td>
<td>04/25/2016</td>
<td>sajolida</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fixed-without-qt.png</td>
<td>11.1 KB</td>
<td>04/25/2016</td>
<td>sajolida</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>